

# COMMONWEALTH OF PUERTO RICO PUERTO RICO ENERGY COMMISSION

IN RE: PUERTO RICO ELECTRIC POWER
AUTHORITY RATE REVIEW

CASE NO.: CEPR-AP-2015-0001

**SUBJECT:** Rebuttal Testimony Late Filing; Panel Correction; Commission's Experts Reports.

#### RESOLUTION

#### I. Late filing of rebuttal testimony

The Puerto Rico Energy Commission ("Commission") required the Puerto Rico Electric Power Authority ("PREPA") to file its rebuttal testimonies by November 10, 2016. On such date, PREPA filed a motion requesting an extension until November 16, 2016, which was granted by the Commission.

On November 16, 2016 PREPA filed part of its rebuttal testimony accompanied by a motion notifying the Commission that it was not able to file several testimonies in time and therefore requested an extension to file such testimonies by Thursday, November 17, 2016. Specifically, PREPA argued that the rebuttal testimonies from Javier Quintana-Méndez¹, Lisa Donahue² and the panel testimony of Javier Quintana-Mendez, Antonio Pérez Sales and Virgilio Sosa³ were not completed due to lack of availability from the witnesses to approve the final testimonies.

On November 18, 2016, PREPA filed two of the three missing testimonies, Ex. 19.0 Lisa Donahue and Ex. 21.0 Javier Quintana-Mendez, Antonio Pérez Sales and Virgilio Sosa. PREPA did not file Ex. 18.0 Javier Quintana-Méndez as notified in its November 16, 2016 motion.

After reviewing PREPA's arguments, the Commission **DENIES** PREPA's request for leave to file the testimonies. The Commission's deadline for PREPA to file its rebuttal testimony was November 16, 2016. The strict period of time established by Act 57-2014<sup>4</sup> for the Commission to issue a final determination in the instant proceeding requires PREPA to work diligently in providing the Commission with the necessary information to make a complete and comprehensive analysis of PREPA's Petition to Review Rates. The multiple time extension requests and delays in the information submittal impair the Commission's ability to do its job and comply with the statutory deadline. The rebuttal testimony of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ex. 18.0 Javier Quintana-Méndez.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Ex. 19.0 Lisa Donahue.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Ex. 21.0 Javier Quintana-Mendez, Antonio Pérez Sales and Virgilio Sosa.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Puerto Rico Energy Transformation and RELIEF Act, as amended.



Donahue and panel testimony of Quintana, Pérez and Sosa were filed after the deadline, therefore they are hereby rejected. PREPA shall file no more rebuttal testimonies.

#### II. Corrections to Panel Distribution Resolution

On November 18, 2016, the Commission issued a Resolution and Order notifying all parties the procedural rules and composition of the witness panels during the technical hearings. Due to clerical error, the witnesses included in **Panel F** were incorrect. The correct witnesses that shall appear before the Commission during **Panel F** are as follows:

# Panel F: Methods for updating rates and ensuring prudence Commencement Date: December 8, 2016

#### Witnesses:

Hemphill for PREPA Woolf for Commission Staff Kunkel and Sanzillo for ICSEPR Masses for Manufacturers Association

In addition, on **Panel D** the name of the witness for the Hospital Associations was omitted. For this panel the Commission also calls Mr. Plá Cortes.

## III. Commission's Experts Reports

The Commission hereby notifies all parties that it will publish five reports authored by the Commission's technical consultants. These reports will address the following subjects: Revenue Requirement Equation, authored by Ralph Smith and Mark Dady; Financial Issues, authored by Steven Hill; Reasonableness of Costs, authored by Jeremy Fisher and Ariel Horowitz; Revenue Allocation, Rate Design and Distributed Generation, authored by Paul Chernick; and Methods for Updating Rates and Ensuring Prudence, authored by Tim Woolf.

The Commission's experts will appear on the panels as indicated on the November 18, 2016 Resolution and Order and will be available for examination by the parties during the technical hearings. The Commission has determined to publish its technical expert reports in order to provide all parties an opportunity to comment on the analysis conducted, and recommendations made, by the Commission's consultants. The Commission has determined that doing so is consistent with the provisions of Act 57-2014 regarding the transparency of the proceedings. In addition, it will ensure an ample and adequate exchange of information and ideas, which will ultimately result in a well-informed and duly-grounded final determination by the Commission. The Commission's technical experts are part of the Commission's staff and shall not be considered as parties to the case, therefore their reports are not subject to discovery. In preparing their reports consultants based their analysis in the information filed by PRPEA in its Petition for Rate Reviews and the responses and information filed during discovery. All reports will be circulated no later than **Wednesday**, **November 23, 2016**.



For the benefit of all the parties involved, the Commission issues this Resolution in both Spanish and English languages. Should any conflict between each version arise, the English version shall prevail.

Be it notified and published.

Agustín F. Carbó Lugo

Chairman

Ángel R. Rivera de la Cruz

Associate Commissioner

José H. Román Morales

Associate Commissioner

#### CERTIFICATION

I hereby certify that the majority of the members of the Puerto Rico Energy Commission has so agreed on November 21, 2016 and on this date a copy of this Resolution was notified by n-ayala@aeepr.com, electronic mail the following: c-aquino@aeepr.com, to john.ratnaswamy@r3Law.com, glenn.rippie@r3law.com, michael.guerra@r3law.com, codiot@opic.pr.gov, jperez@oipc.pr.gov, mmuntanerlaw@gmail.com, jose.maeso@aae.pr.gov, ifeliciano@constructorespr.net, abogados@fuerteslaw.com, edwin.quinones@aae.pr.gov, nydinmarie.watlington@cemex.com, aconer.pr@gmail.com, jorgehernandez@escopr.net, ecandelaria@camarapr.net, epenergypr@gmail.com, manuelgabrielfernandez@gmail.com, pga@caribe.net, eirizarry@ccdlawpr.com agraitfe@agraitlawpr.com, maribel.cruz@acueductospr.com, mgrpcorp@gmail.com, attystgo@yahoo.com and pnieves@vnblegal.com.

> María del Mar Cintrón Alvarado Clerk

3



I also certify that today, November <u>22</u>, 2016, I have proceeded with the filing of the Resolution issued by the Puerto Rico Energy Commission and I have sent a true and exact copy to the following:

### **Puerto Rico Electric Power Authority**

Attn.: Nélida Ayala Jiménez Carlos M. Aquino Ramos P.O. Box 363928 Correo General San Juan, PR 00936-4267

## Oficina Independiente de Protección al Consumidor

p/c Lcdo. José A. Pérez Vélez Lcda. Coral M. Odiot Rivera 268 Hato Rey Center Suite 524 San Juan, Puerto Rico 00918

## Autoridad de Acueductos y Alcantarillados de Puerto Rico

p/c Lcda. Maribel Cruz De León PO Box 7066 San Juan, Puerto Rico 00916

# Asociación de Constructores de Puerto Rico

p/c Lcdo. José Alberto Feliciano PO Box 192396 San Juan, Puerto Rico 00919-2396

#### CEMEX de Puerto Rico, Inc.

Lcdo. Edwin A. Irizarry Lugo CCD Law Group, P.S.C. 712 Ave. Ponce de León San Juan, Puerto Rico 00918

## Asociación de Consultores y Contratistas de Energía Renovable de Puerto Rico

p/c Edward Previdi PO Box 16714 San Juan, Puerto Rico 00908-6714

## Rooney Rippie & Ratnaswamy LLP

E. Glenn Rippie John P. Ratnaswamy Michael Guerra 350 W. Hubbard St., Suite 600 Chicago Illinois 60654

### **Sunnova Energy Corporation**

p/c Vidal, Nieves & Bauzá, LLC Lcdo. Pedro J. Nieves Miranda P.O. Box 366219 San Juan, PR 00936-6219

# Autoridad Acueductos y Alcantarillados de Puerto Rico

Lcdo. Pedro Santiago Rivera 305 Calle Villamil, 1508 San Juan, Puerto Rico 00907

#### Centro Unido de Detallistas, Inc.

Lcdo. Héctor Fuertes Romeu PMB 191 – PO Box 194000 San Juan, Puerto Rico 00919-4000

#### **CEMEX de Puerto Rico, Inc.**

p/c Enrique A. García Lcda. Nydin M. Watlington PO Box 364487 San Juan, Puerto Rico 00936-4487

# **Energy & Environmental Consulting Services Corp.**

Jorge Hernández, PE, CEM, BEP 560 C/ Aldebarán, Urb. Altamira San Juan, Puerto Rico 00920



y

#### Cámara de Comercio de Puerto Rico

p/c Eunice S. Candelaria De Jesús PO Box 9024033 San Juan, Puerto Rico 00902-4033

# Asociación de Industriales de Puerto Rico

p/c Manuel Fernández Mejías 2000 Carr. 8177, Suite 26-246 Guaynabo, Puerto Rico 00966

# Asociación de Hospitales de Puerto Rico

p/c Lcda. Marie Carmen Muntaner Rodríguez 470 Ave. Cesar González San Juan, Puerto Rico 00918-2627

# Instituto de Competitividad sostenibilidad Económica de Puerto Rico

p/c Lcdo. Fernando E. Agrait 701 Ave. Ponce de León Edif. Centro de Seguros, Suite 401 San Juan, Puerto Rico 00907

# Oficina Estatal de Política Pública Energética

p/c Ing. José G. Maeso González Lcdo. Edwin J. Quiñones Porrata P.O. Box 41314 San Juan, Puerto Rico 00940

## Grupo Windmar

p/c Lcdo. Marc G. Roumain Prieto 1702 Ave. Ponce de León, 2do Piso San Juan, Puerto Rico 00909

For the record, I sign this in San Juan, Puerto Rico, today, November 22, 2016.

María del Mar Cintrón Alvarado Clerk