# GOVERNMENT OF PUERTO RICO PUBLIC SERVICE REGULATORY BOARD PUERTO RICO ENERGY BUREAU

IN RE: PUERTO RICO ELECTRIC POWER AUTHORITY RATE REVIEW

**CASE NO.:** NEPR-AP-2023-0003

**SUBJECT:** Determination on Request for Accessibility to Processes to Ensure Citizen Participation.

## **RESOLUTION AND ORDER**

### I. Introduction

On April 11, 2025, the Independent Office of Consumer Protection of the Public Service Regulatory Board ("OIPC" by its Spanish acronym) filed a document titled *Request for Accessibility to Processes to Ensure Citizen Participation\_*("April 11 Motion") with the Energy Bureau of the Public Service Regulatory Board ("Energy Bureau") seeking the establishment of a formal protocol to guarantee the population, whose dominant language is Spanish, easy understanding of the current rate review procedure. The OIPC expresses concern that the proceedings are being conducted entirely in English, which it argues affects citizen participation.

1

The OIPC specifically requests: (1) Spanish translations of key documents, including orders, resolutions, and the rate review filing; (2) continued implementation of simultaneous translation during public and technical hearings; (3) holding hearings for the general public in Spanish; and (4) establishment of a formal protocol to ensure Spanish-speaking participants do not face linguistic disadvantages.



The OIPC cites several legal and factual bases for its request. Law 57-2014<sup>1</sup>, requires the OIPC to coordinate citizen participation in the internal rate review process of the Puerto Rico Energy Power Authority ("PREPA") and before the Energy Bureau. That same law also requires the Energy Bureau to provide the opportunity for citizen participation in rate modification processes. The OIPC notes that, according to the U.S. Census Bureau, 94.9% of Puerto Rico's population speaks only Spanish. The OIPC argues that conducting the procedure solely in English affects citizen participation, which both the OIPC and the Energy Bureau are obliged to guarantee and promote. The OIPC notes that in a previous rate review proceeding (*In re: Rate Review of the Puerto Rico Electric Power Authority*, Case No.: CEPRAP-2015-0001), similar measures to those requested were established.



# II. Analysis

The Energy Bureau recognizes the importance of citizen access and participation in all proceedings, particularly in matters as impactful as rate reviews. The Energy Bureau has consistently maintained a commitment to language accessibility throughout all its proceedings, including the current rate review procedure.



The Energy Bureau acknowledges the OIPC's concerns regarding language accessibility and agrees that additional measures can enhance public understanding and participation. The Energy Bureau finds merit in the OIPC's request to ensure all substantive content is accessible to Spanish-speaking participants.

The Energy Bureau clarifies that all its proceedings are designed to be inclusive of both Spanish and English speakers. This bilingual approach reflects the reality of Puerto Rico's regulatory environment, which involves diverse stakeholders, including local citizens, mainland-based technical experts, and federal entities.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Known as Puerto Rico Energy Transformation and RELIEF Act, as amended ("Act 57-2014")

Regarding the specific concerns raised by the OIPC, the Energy Bureau addresses each point:

## A. Language Accessibility in Current Proceedings

The Energy Bureau has implemented and will continue to maintain the following language accessibility measures in all proceedings, including the current rate review:

- 1. All public hearings include live simultaneous interpretation services between Spanish and English, ensuring participants can follow proceedings in their preferred language;
- 2. Participants may file documents in either Spanish or English according to their preference, with no disadvantage to either language of choice;
- 3. During hearings, participants may speak in Spanish or English. When a participant speaks in Spanish, an interpreter provides live interpretation to English, and vice versa;
- 4. All proceedings are streamed via the Energy Bureau's YouTube channel with both Spanish and English audio options, ensuring broader public access; and
- 5. As established in the February 12, 2025 Order in this case, LUMA must file all public notices in both Spanish and English.

# B. Additional Language Accessibility Requirement

To further enhance accessibility and ensure meaningful participation by all stakeholders, the Energy Bureau hereby establishes an additional requirement:

All parties submitting documents containing substantive content in English must include a concise summary in Spanish as part of the same filing—not as a separate exhibit or standalone document. This summary must clearly present the main points, conclusions, and any specific requests contained in the English-language filing to ensure that Spanish-speaking participants can understand the essential elements.

This requirement applies to all substantive filings submitted on or after the issuance date of this Resolution and Order. Substantive filings include, but are not limited to, technical reports, expert testimony, and legal arguments. The Spanish-language summary should be sufficiently detailed to communicate the key aspects of the filing.

# C. Technical Considerations

The Energy Bureau acknowledges the technical nature of regulatory proceedings, particularly those involving complex electric system matters. These proceedings often include specialized terminology and concepts that require precision in communication.

The Energy Bureau recognizes that participants in these proceedings include a diverse group of stakeholders with varying language preferences, including:

- 1. Local consumers and community representatives;
- 2. Technical experts from both Puerto Rico and the U.S. mainland;
- 3. Federal oversight entities; and
- 4. International consultants and industry specialists.

To serve this diverse community effectively, the Energy Bureau maintains its commitment to bilingual accessibility while acknowledging that certain technical documents or testimony may originate in one language and require translation.

Based on the above analysis, the Energy Bureau finds that the current language accessibility measures in place for all Energy Bureau proceedings, including the rate review procedure, provide appropriate accommodation for both Spanish and English speakers. All participants are afforded equal opportunity to engage in proceedings in their preferred language through









simultaneous translation services, document filing flexibility, and bilingual public notices. The Energy Bureau has consistently implemented these measures across all proceedings and will continue to do so for this rate review.

The Energy Bureau also finds that requiring Spanish summaries for English submissions, as requested by the OIPC, would enhance citizen understanding and participation. This additional requirement strikes an appropriate balance between technical precision and public accessibility.

### III. Conclusion

The Energy Bureau **DETERMINES** that its current language accessibility practices, with the addition of the new Spanish summary requirement for English submissions, adequately address the concerns raised by the OIPC through its April 11 Motion. The Energy Bureau **AFFIRMS** its commitment to bilingual proceedings that ensure meaningful participation by all stakeholders, regardless of language preference.

The Energy Bureau **REAFFIRMS** OIPC's request to enhance language accessibility by requiring Spanish summaries for all substantive submissions in English. This requirement balances the technical nature of these proceedings with the need to ensure that all citizens can meaningfully participate in and understand the rate review process.

The Energy Bureau hereby **ORDERS** all participants in this proceeding to take notice of and adopt these requirements without exception. Compliance with these language accessibility requirements is mandatory for all parties going forward.

The Energy Bureau **REAFFIRMS** that testimony, documents, and participation may continue in either Spanish or English according to participant preference, with translation services ensuring comprehension by all parties. This balanced approach honors Puerto Rico's linguistic heritage while acknowledging the technical and diverse nature of these proceedings.

The Energy Bureau will continue to monitor language accessibility throughout this proceeding and make additional accommodations, as necessary, to fulfill its statutory mandate to ensure inclusive public participation.

Be it notified and published.

Edison Avilés Deliz

Chairman

Lillian Mateo Santos

Associate Commissioner

Ferdinand A. Ramos Soegaard Associate Commissioner

Antonio Torres Miranda

ADO

Associate Commissioner

### **CERTIFICATION**

I certify that the majority of the members of the Puerto Rico Energy Bureau has so agreed on May 9, 2025. Associate Commissioner Sylvia B. Ugarte Araujo did not intervene. I also certify that on May 9, 2025 a copy of this Resolution and Order was notified by electronic mail to mvalle@gmlex.net; arivera@gmlex.net; jmartinez@gmlex.net, jgonzalez@gmlex.net; Yahaira.delarosa@us.dlapiper.com; margarita.mercado@us.dlapiper.com; carolyn.clarkin@us.dlapiper.com; andrea.chambers@us.dlapiper.com; jennalvarez@sbgblaw.com; gcastrodad@sbgblaw.com; jfr@sbgblaw.com; regulatory@genera-pr.com; legal@genera-pr.com; hrivera@jrsp.pr.gov; contratistas@jrsp.pr.gov; victorluisgonzalez@yahoo.com; Cfl@mcvpr.com; nancy@emmanuelli.law; jrinconlopez@guidehouse.com; Josh.Llamas@fticonsulting.com; Ellen.Smith@fticonsulting.com; Intisarul.Islam@weil.com; Anu.Sen@fticonsulting.com; kara.smith@weil.com; rafael.ortiz.mendoza@gmail.com; rolando@emmanuelli.law; jan.albinolopez@us.dlapiper.com; Rachel.Albanese@us.dlapiper.com; varoon.sachdev@whitecase.com; epo@amgprlaw.com; loliver@amgprlaw.com; acasellas@amgprlaw.com; matt.barr@weil.com; Robert.berezin@weil.com; Gabriel.morgan@weil.com; corey.brady@weil.com; lramos@ramoscruzlegal.com; tlauria@whitecase.com; gkurtz@whitecase.com; ccolumbres@whitecase.com; isaac.glassman@whitecase.com; tmacwright@whitecase.com; jcunningham@whitecase.com; mshepherd@whitecase.com; jgreen@whitecase.com; hburgos@cabprlaw.com; dperez@cabprlaw.com; howard.hawkins@cwt.com; mark.ellenberg@cwt.com; casey.servais@cwt.com; bill.natbony@cwt.com; thomas.curtin@cwt.com; escalera@reichardescalera.com; riverac@reichardescalera.com; susheelkirpalani@quinnemanuel.com; erickay@quinnemanuel.com; dmonserrate@msglawpr.com; fgierbolini@msglawpr.com; rschell@msglawpr.com; eric.brunstad@dechert.com; Stephen.zide@dechert.com; David.herman@dechert.com; Julia@londoneconomics.com; Brian@londoneconomics.com; luke@londoneconomics.com; juan@londoneconomics.com; mmcgill@gibsondunn.com; LShelfer@gibsondunn.com; scasillas@cstlawpr.com; jnieves@cstlawpr.com; arrivera@nuenergypr.com; rsmithla@aol.com; guy@maxetaenergy.com; jorge@maxetaenergy.com; rafael@maxetaenergy.com; dawn.bisdorf@gmail.com; msdady@gmail.com; mcranston29@gmail.com; ahopkins@synapse-energy.com; clane@synapse-energy.com; kbailey@acciongroup.com; hjudd@acciongroup.com; zachary.ming@ethree.com; PREBconsultants@acciongroup.com; carl.pechman@keylogic.com; bernard.neenan@keylogic.com, I have proceeded with the filing of the Resolution and Order issued by the Puerto Rico Energy Bureau.

I sign this in San Juan, Puerto Rico, today May 9, 2025.

Sonia Seda Gaztambide Clerk